

Title: Problems in source sequences and in ACR-HRR test setup
Source: OPTICOM
Contact: Marcus Barkowsky, OPTICOM, Germany, mb@opticom.de
 Roland Bitto, OPTICOM, Germany, rb@opticom.de
Tel: +49 9131 53020-0
Fax: +49 9131 53020-20

Introduction

This document summarizes the problems we found in the subjective test software for the ACR-HRR test and the visible degradations of the sequences in the in the current source sequence pool.

ACR-HRR with subjective test software AcrVqWinBeta2

We used the AcrVqWinBeta2 software provided by Acro to evaluate the different sequences in QCIF and CIF. In order to see how a video coder reacts on the sequences we combined the original video on the left with a medium quality coded video on the right, so the display width was doubled in this case. We saw each video sequence twice so we could concentrate once on the coded side and once on the undistorted video. We therefore did not use the program as intended but with larger and longer sequences than usual.

However, some of the results may still be valid:

- The program crashed if a non-existing input path for a sequence was given in the configuration file
- The “PixelDepth” should be changed from 16 to 24 or 32 in the configuration file depending on the graphics card. Otherwise color quantization artifacts are clearly visible, e.g. in the background of the NTIA_SRC_bells5 sequence.
- How can we setup the program to run the practice trials at the start of the subjective sessions?

ACR-HRR test setup and PVS creation

During the preparation of our viewing session, we came across some additional questions:

- How do we prepare the training data at the start of each session (practice trials)? Which SRCs and HRCs do we use for those? This should ideally be clarified before the PVS creation starts.
- The CommonSet sequences are mostly 30fps. How do we use them in a 25fps subjective test? Do we use a playback of 25fps or 30fps? If we use 25fps then we will have to select a corresponding range of frames or we will have to temporally subsample the original content. On the other hand, if we use 30fps then additional effort will be necessary to create the PVS in 30fps as well as in 25fps.

General comments on the MM Scene Pool

The sequences in the current MM Scene Pool provide a wide variety of different content and the content of most of them is also not annoying for the viewer.

The quality of the original sequences seems to vary from consumer cameras to very high quality studio cameras. Depending on the illumination situation some of the sequences show typical degradations, e.g. noise, too.

It seems that the conversion step from the (interlaced) original video sequence to the new video size, e.g. QCIF, CIF, VGA has often introduced artifacts. Some of them are typical but not all of them. We commented on each sequence below but there are two classes of distortions which should be addressed:

1. Single frame distortions: Some of the sequences contain implausible distortions like repeated blocks or streaks. Those distortions may be due to transmission errors somewhere in the processing and distribution chain.
2. De-interlacing: In nearly all sequences with fast motion the frames are distorted by high frequency artifacts. These often occur in homogeneous regions and not around borders. They are usually not visible for the viewer because they vanish (or move to a different position) in the next frame. However, both the HRC creation as well as the measurement will have problems with this kind of artifacts. It leads to the situation that a low-pass filtered sequence looks more natural than the reference sequence. On the other hand side, most of the sequences which are currently transmitted worldwide are derived from interlaced material and thus different de-interlacing artifacts may occur. Therefore, we would like to propose to use different algorithms for the de-interlacing of different sequences in a random fashion.

Detailed comments on the MM scene pool

In the following we comment on each sequence separately. The comments are also weighted by orange and red color depending on the severity. Some of the distortions are allowed by the testplan and are just described as a noticeable impairment. None of the sequences has to be rejected in our opinion but in some cases it would be more important to consider a replacement than in others.

Those sequences which were mentioned in the document by Quan from Psytechnics are marked with a (P) for easier comparison. Only our comments are given.

QCIF Common Set

IRCCyN_anim1_qcif.avi

CU_SRC_bbshoot_qcif.avi

(O) In Frame 264 : Brightness fluctuations above scoreboard.

NTIA_SRC_SusieStill_qcif.avi

CU_SRC_bcancer2_qcif.avi

(P,O) KBS_SRC_gayoB_qcif.avi - Is also included in set qcif.W – 30fps

CU_SRC_presents1_qcif.avi

CIF Common Set

IRCCyN_anim13_cif.avi
[CU_SRC_presents3_cif.avi](#)
(P)
NTT_SRC_Talk_1-4_cif.avi
[KBS_SRC_mubankA_cif.avi](#)
(P,O) Is also included in set cif.M – 30fps
[NTIA_SRC_WashdcStill_cif.avi](#)
(O) Frame 23: slight distortions in the upper left quarter.
(Above Hay Adams Hotel)
[CU_SRC_bbfoul_cif.avi](#)
(P)

VGA Common Set

[NTIA_SRC_stadpan_vga.avi](#)
(P,O) Is also included in set vga.K – 30fps
[SVT_SRC_crowdrunP_vga.avi](#)
(P,O) Is also included in set vga.C – 25fps and vga.H - 25fps
[KBS_SRC_newsG_vga.avi](#)
(P,O) Is also included in set vga.K – 30fps
Some deinterlacing artifacts

[KBS_SRC_gayoD_vga.avi](#)
[NTIA_SRC_duckmovie_vga.avi](#)
(O) Every 4. Frame is repeated
[OPT_SRC_013_vga.avi](#)

QCIF Scene Pools

qcif.A – 25fps
[IRCCyN_Gob2_qcif.avi](#)
[OPT_SRC_016p_qcif.avi](#)
[ITU_SRC_BicycleRace_qcif.avi](#)
[PSY_SRC_skidh02_qcif.avi](#)
[T_W_01_q.avi](#)
[SQ_SRC_Living_Room_qcif.avi](#)
[CRC_SRC_Carrousel25fps_qcif.avi](#)
[OPT_SRC_010_qcif.avi](#)
(O) Quantized color map

qcif.D – 25fps
[OPT_SRC_015p_qcif.avi](#)
[OPT_SRC_021_qcif.avi](#)
(O) Large distortions in frame 3,24,125,153,145

ITU_SRC_f1raceB_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_ftballslow_qcif.avi
T_W_06_q.avi
T_W_04_q.avi
FT_SRC_news_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_playerout25fps_qcif.avi

qcif.G – 25fps

NTIA_SRC_fcnstop25fps_qcif.avi
T_W_09_q.avi
ITU_SRC_f1raceA_qcif.avi
ITU_SRC_arrividerci2_qcif.avi
OPT_SRC_006_qcif.avi
SQ_SRC_Living_Room_qcif.avi
FT_SRC_news_qcif.avi
PSY_SRC_drink01_qcif.avi

qcif.I – 25fps

OPT_SRC_020_qcif.avi
PSY_SRC_footb01_qcif.avi
ITU_SRC_ccraceA_qcif.avi
OPT_SRC_013_qcif.avi
T_W_08_q.avi
NTIA_SRC_stadpan25fps_qcif.avi
IRCCyN_Gob2_qcif.avi
(O) The framerate is 30fps but the test is 25fps
T_W_03_q.avi

qcif.J – 30fps

CRC_SRC_bench_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_wanggunD_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_playerout_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_leeparkA_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsH_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_twoducks_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_guitar3_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD08_qcif.avi

qcif.K – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_tealp_qcif.avi
(O) Last scene cut below 1 second.
KBS_SRC_newsG_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_stadpan_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_overview2_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_winterA_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_gayoA_qcif.avi

KDDI_SRC_3D11_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD03_qcif.avi

qcif.L – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_collage1_qcif.avi
CRC_SRC_carrousel_qcif.avi
ITU_SRC_popple_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_spectrum1_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsF_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_bells5_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD01_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD19_qcif.avi

qcif.P – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_cartalk1_qcif.avi
(O) Minor color quantization artifacts at the top of the car

KDDI_SRC_3D02_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_pghtruck2a_qcif.vai
KBS_SRC_wanggunB_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD14_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_mubankBp_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_ffgear_qcif.avi
ANSI_SRC_vtc2mp_qcif.avi

qcif.S – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_rfdev2_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_rbtnews1_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_bpit5_qcif.avi
(O) Every 5. Frame is repeated
KBS_SRC_gayoE_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_leeparkC_qcif.avi
(O) Flickering , in the bottom of the sequence
NTIA_SRC_twogeese_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_pghvansd_qcif.avi
SMPTE_SRC_bicycles_qcif.avi

qcif.T – 30fps

KBS_SRC_mubankE_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_catjoke_qcif.avi
NTIA_SRC_towtruck1_qcif.avi
KBS_SRC_wanggunC_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_3D10_qcif.avi
(O) Color quantization distortions in the black bar.
NTIA_SRC_pghtruck2a_qcif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD15_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_newsD_qcif.avi

qcif.U – 30fps

CRC_SRC_volleyball_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_fcnstop_qcif.avi

(O) The reflections and flashes possibly lead to viewer irritations.

KBS_SRC_wanggunG_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_music3_qcif.avi

CU_SRC_presents4_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_schart2_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_fish5_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_newsEp_qcif.avi

qcif.V – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_tea4_qcif.avi

CRC_SRC_headshot_qcif.avi

KDDI_SRC_SD11_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_soccerD_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_mubankBp_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_bpit2_qcif.avi

(O) Every 5. Frame is repeated

KBS_SRC_newsH_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_rbtnews2_qcif.avi

qcif.W – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_playerout_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_leeparkD_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_mubankD_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_newsG_qcif.avi

KBS_SRC_gayoB_qcif.avi

KDDI_SRC_SD16_qcif.avi

YONSEI_SRC_zooC_qcif.avi

KDDI_SRC_3D04_qcif.avi

qcif.X – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_firemovie1_qcif.avi

CRC_SRC_volleyball_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_cchart3pp_qcif.avi

CRC_SRC_carrousel_qcif.avi

CRC_SRC_bench_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_collage5_qcif.avi

NTIA_SRC_heli02_qcif.avi

SMPTE_SRC_birches1_qcif.avi

CIF Scene Pools

cif.B – 25fps

SQ_SRC_ChildrenPlaying_cif.avi
ITU_SRC_ccraceA_cif.avi
SVT_SRC_PrincessRunPP_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_ftballslow_cif.avi
IRCCyN_SRC_Gob3_cif.avi
T_W_02_cif.avi
PSY_SRC_inter01_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_stadpan25fps_cif.avi

cif.E – 25fps

SVT_SRC_ParkJoyPP_cif.avi
FT_SRC_visio_cif.avi
OPT_SRC_015p_cif.avi
PSY_SRC_ccski01_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_heli0225fps_cif.avi
PSY_SRC_festi01_cif.avi
OPT_SRC_009_cif.avi
T_W_07_c.avi

cif.G – 25fps

NTIA_SRC_fcnstop25fps_cif.avi
(O) The reflections and flashes possibly lead to viewer irritations.
T_W_09_cif.avi
ITU_SRC_f1raceA_cif.avi
ITU_SRC_arrividerci2_cif.avi
IRCCyN_SRC_Gob3_cif.avi
SQ_SRC_Living_Room_cif.avi
FT_SRC_news_cif.avi
PSY_SRC_drink01_cif.avi

cif.H – 25fps

OPT_SRC_020_cif.avi
(P)
PSY_SRC_ccski02_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_volleyball25fps_cif.avi
FT_SRC_visio_cif.avi
OPT_SRC_016p_cif.avi
SVT_SRC_CrowdRunP_cif.avi
(O) Distortions in frame 272, however this frame is outside the 8 sec border.
NTIA_SRC_heli0225fps_cif.avi
OPT_SRC_008_cif.avi
(O) Temporally downsampled by 3 frame repeats in the first part

cif.J – 30fps

CRC_SRC_bench_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_wanggunD_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_playerout_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_leeparkA_cif.avi
(P)
KBS_SRC_newsH_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_twoducks_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_guitar3_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD08_cif.avi

cif.L – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_collage1_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_carrousel_cif.avi
ITU_SRC_popple_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_spectrum1_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsF_cif.avi
(O) Flickering in fountain and microphone.
NTIA_SRC_bells5_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD01_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD19_cif.avi

cif.M – 30fps

CRC_SRC_houseoffer_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_brick2_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_heli02_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_magic1_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_soccerB_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD16_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_mobike_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_mubankA_cif.avi

cif.N – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_firemovie1_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_fcnstop_cif.avi
CBC_SRC_LePoint_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_wfall_cif.avi
SMPTE_SRC_birches2_cif.avi
(P)
KDDI_SRC_3D09_cif.avi
(P,O) Green bar at the bottom of the sequence.
NTIA_SRC_fish1_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_redflower_cif.avi

cif.O – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_pghtalk1a_cif.avi

CRC_SRC_headshot_cif.avi
ITU_SRC_ungenerique_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_FlamingoHilton_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsA_cif.avi
 (O) Visible interlace artifacts on the shirt.
KBS_SRC_newsBp_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_volleyball_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_bpit1_cif.avi
 (O) Guard net may irritate the viewer. This could lead to large variance of the results.

cif.Q – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_hose_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_stadsc_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_morningBp_cif.avi
CBC_SRC_BetesPasBetesP_cif.avi
NTIA_nstopbf_cif.avi
NTT_SRC_Block_2-1_cif.avi
 (O) Blurred speaker due to consumer camera.
KBS_soccerD_cif.avi
Yonsei_SRC_zooA_cif.avi

cif.R – 30fps

KBS_SRC_mubankCp_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_soccerC_cif.avi
 (O) Local interlace artifacts.
KDDI_SRC_3D01_cif.avi
 (P)
ITU_SRC_MobileCalendar_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_drumfeet_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_fishrob1_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_CaesarsPalace_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_collage5_cif.avi

cif.U – 30fps

CRC_SRC_volleyball_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_fcnstop_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_wanggunG_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_music3_cif.avi
CU_SRC_presents4_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_schart2_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_fish5_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsEp_cif.avi

cif.W – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_playerout_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_leeparkD_cif.avi
 (O) Clearly visible Interlace artifacts
KBS_SRC_mubankD_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_newsG_cif.avi
KBS_SRC_gayoB_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD16_cif.avi
YONSEI_SRC_zooC_cif.avi
KDDI_SRC_3D04_cif.avi
 (O) Green border at the bottom of the sequence

cif.X – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_firemovie1_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_volleyball_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_cchart3pp_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_carrousel_cif.avi
CRC_SRC_bench_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_collage5_cif.avi
NTIA_SRC_heli02_cif.avi
SMPTE_SRC_birches1_cif.avi

VGA Scene Pools

vga.C – 25fps

ITU_SRC_popple625_vga.avi
 (O) 30fps sequence in 25fps test set
 (O) White dot in the blue background. Not annoying
PSY_SRC_skidh03_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_004_vga.avi
 (P)
PSY_SRC_festi02_vga.avi
T_W_05p_v.avi
 (O) Huge coding artifacts in frame 261. (DCT basis functions)
SVT_SRC_CrowdRunP_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_008_vga.avi
 (P)
T_W_02_v.avi

vga.E – 25fps

SVT_SRC_ParkJoyPP_vga.avi
FT_SRC_visio_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_015p_vga.avi
PSY_SRC_ccski01_vga.avi

NTIA_SRC_heli0225fps_vga.avi
PSY_SRC_festi01_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_009_vga.avi
(P,O) Field ordering mismatch. (Error is prominent in the displayed numbers)
T_W_07_v.avi

vga.F – 25fps

SVT_SRC_IntoTree_vga.avi
ITU_SRC_ccraceB_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_006_vga.avi
(P,O) Spatial color displacement in every second frame.
T_W_10_v.avi
(P)
T_W_08_v.avi
OPT_SRC_01p_vga.avi
(P)
ITU_SRC_CalMobB625_vga.avi
(P)
NTIA_SRC_ftballslow_vga.avi
(P)

vga.H – 25fps – repeat of CIF set

OPT_SRC_020_vga.avi
(P)
PSY_SRC_ccski02_vga.avi
CRC_SRC_volleyball25fps_vga.avi
(O) Interlace artifacts in frame 169 and following
FT_SRC_visio_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_016p_vga.avi
SVT_SRC_CrowdRunP_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_heli0225fps_vga.avi
OPT_SRC_008_vga.avi
(P)

vga.K – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_tealp_vga.avi
KBS_SRC_newsG_vga.avi
(O) Temporal flickering
NTIA_SRC_stadpan_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_overview2_vga.avi
KBS_SRC_winterA_vga.avi
(O) Critically blurred sequence. May lead to large variance of test results.
KBS_SRC_gayoA_vga.avi
(O) Interlace artifacts (prominent in frame 54)
KDDI_SRC_3D11_vga.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD03_vga.avi

vga.L – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_collage1_vga.avi
CRC_SRC_carrousel_vga.avi
(P)
ITU_SRC_popple_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_spectrum1_vga.avi
KBS_SRC_newsF_vga.avi
(O) Interlace flickering (prominent at the microphone)
NTIA_SRC_bells5_vga.avi
(O) Color quantization and interlace artifacts
KDDI_SRC_SD01_vga.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD19_vga.avi
(P)

vga.M – 30fps

CRC_SRC_houseoffer_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_brick2_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_heli02_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_magic1_vga.avi
KBS_SRC_soccerB_vga.avi
(P)
KDDI_SRC_SD16_vga.avi
(P)
CRC_SRC_mobike_vga.avi
(O) Critically blurred
KBS_SRC_mubankA_vga.avi
(P)

vga.N – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_firemovie1_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_fcnstop_vga.avi
(O) The reflections and flashes possibly lead to viewer irritations.
CBC_SRC_LePoint_vga.avi
(O) Sequence temporally downsampled by a factor of 2. Interlace artifacts visible.
NTIA_SRC_wfall_vga.avi
SMPTE_SRC_birches2_vga.avi
(P)
KDDI_SRC_3D09_vga.avi
(P,O) Green bar at the bottom of the sequence.
NTIA_SRC_fish1_vga.avi
CRC_SRC_redflower_vga.avi

vga.O – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_pgthtalk1a_vga.avi
CRC_SRC_headshot_vga.avi

ITU_SRC_ungenerique_vga.avi
(O) Color distortions in text.
CRC_SRC_FlamingoHilton_vga.avi
(P)
KBS_SRC_newsA_vga.avi
(P,O) Color flickering
KBS_SRC_newsBp_vga.avi
(P,O) Color flickering
CRC_SRC_volleyball_vga.avi
(O) Interlacing artifacts
NTIA_SRC_bpit1_vga.avi
(O) Guard net possibly irritate the subject. This could lead to large variance of the results.

vga.P – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_cartalk1_vga.avi
(O) Color quantisation
KDDI_SRC_3D02_vga.avi
(P)
NTIA_SRC_pghtruck2a_vga.vai
KBS_SRC_wanggunB_vga.avi
KDDI_SRC_SD14_vga.avi
(P,O) Interlace artifacts
KBS_SRC_mubankBp_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_ffgear_vga.avi
ANSI_SRC_vtc2mp_vga.avi

vga.Q – 30fps

NTIA_SRC_hose_vga.avi
NTIA_SRC_stadsc_vga.avi
(P)
KBS_SRC_morningBp_vga.avi
(P,O) Huge color distortions
CBC_SRC_BetesPasBetesP_vga.avi
NTIA_nstopbm_vga.avi
NTT_SRC_Block_2-3_vga.avi
KBS_soccerD_vga.avi
(P,O) Interlace artifacts
Yonsei_SRC_zooA_vga.avi
(P)

vga.R – 30fps

KBS_SRC_mubankCp_vga.avi
KBS_SRC_soccerC_vga.avi
(P)

[KDDI_SRC_3D01_vga.avi](#)
(P)
[ITU_SRC_MobileCalendar_vga.avi](#)
(P)
[NTIA_SRC_drumfeet_vga.avi](#)
[NTIA_SRC_fishrob1_vga.avi](#)
[CRC_SRC_CaesarsPalace_vga.avi](#)
(P)
[NTIA_SRC_collage5_vga.avi](#)

vga.S – 30fps

[NTIA_SRC_rfdev2_vga.avi](#)
[NTIA_SRC_rbtnews1_vga.avi](#)
[NTIA_SRC_bpit5_vga.avi](#)
[KBS_SRC_gayoE_vga.avi](#)
[KBS_SRC_leeparkC_vga.avi](#)
(P,O) Much color flickering
[NTIA_SRC_twogeese_vga.avi](#)
[NTIA_SRC_pghvansd_vga.avi](#)
[SMPTE_SRC_bicycles_vga.avi](#)
(P)